



HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

Elaine G. Barton – Human Resources Director
201 West Water Street * Piqua, Ohio 45356
(937) 778-2053 - FAX (937) 778-2048
E-Mail: ebarton@piquaoh.org

July 17, 2009

MEMORANDUM

To: Civil Service Commission Members

From: Elaine G. Barton, Human Resources Director

Re: Civil Service Commission Meeting Agenda

Meeting Date: **Thursday, July 23, 2009 – 5:00 p.m.**

Location: **Admin. Conference Room – 2nd Floor MGC**

AGENDA

Roll call of members

1. Approval of minutes of the June 11, 2009 meeting
2. Set date for upcoming Deputy Police Chief promotional process
3. Review of proposal from Stanard & Associates regarding promotional testing for Assistant Fire Chief and Captains
4. **WORK SESSION** – to review current civil service rules
5. Adjourn

cc: Frederick E. Enderle, City Manager
Rick Maggert, Acting Fire Chief
Bruce Jamison, Police Chief
Stacy Wall, Law Director



**MINUTES
CIVIL SERVICE MEETING
THURSDAY, June 11, 2009**

The Civil Service Commission met at 5:00 p.m. in the Municipal Government Complex Administrative Conference Room, second floor, 201 W. Water Street, Piqua, Ohio. Meeting was called to order by Alissa Blankenship, Secretary. Chairman Clayton Brown arrived at 5:04pm.

Those present were Clayton Brown, Dave Vollette, Bruce Hogston and Alissa Blankenship. Members absent were Mike Gutmann. Also present were Elaine Barton, Human Resources Director, Fred Enderle, City Manager, Police Chief Bruce Jamison, Stacy Wall, Law Director, Kris Lee, Bill Hogston, and Jim Roth.

REGULAR CIVIL SERVICE MEETING

Approval of Minutes

A motion to accept the minutes was made by Dave Vollette and seconded by Bruce Hogston. The minutes reflected that Mr. Brown had voted nay on the motion to certify the list for Fire Chief with only the one name of the individual with a passing score. Both Ms. Blankenship and Mr. Hogston thought that Mr. Brown had voted yea. Mr. Brown was asked what his vote had been and he clarified that he had voted nay on the motion (as was reflected in the minutes). Minutes were approved as submitted.

Entry Level Test

Alissa Blankenship asked for the scores of the Police and Fire tests held on June 6, 2009 to be revealed. Elaine Barton distributed the scores and explained that they were also entered in an additional spreadsheet to show the final scores factoring in the extra credit.

Clayton Brown asked if there were any questions, and Alissa Blankenship confirmed that the Certified List only listed the top 35. Sixty-seven (67) had a passing score on the Police test. Ms. Blankenship made a motion to certify the police list. Mr. Vollette seconded and the motion carried. Seventy-three (73) had a passing score on the Fire test. Mr. Hogston made a motion to certify the fire list. Ms. Blankenship seconded and the motion carried.

Stanard & Associates Proposal for Deputy Chief

The commissioners reviewed a proposal from Stanard & Associates for the promotional testing of Deputy Police Chief and gave their approval to retain Stanard for this purpose.

Elaine Barton stated that a date had not been set as of yet. It was stated that the procedure was to advertise in the department the date of the written exam and to allow time for sign up as well as ample time to study (approximately 60 days).

Fire Chief Retesting

Fred Enderle stated that he had received an appeal from Assistant Fire Chief Mike Rindler to retake the Fire Chief promotional exam. Mr. Enderle stated that because the next test will not be give until sometime in the fall that he thinks that his request is reasonable

Mr. Enderle also noted that he asked only those interested in accepting the position to sign up for the test. Dave Vollette asked what happens if the Captains don't want to [take the test]. Mr. Enderle stated that it would then be open to the next level, which is Firefighters.

Bruce Hogston asked if we could do away with the written/essay version. Fred Enderle said he is perfectly fine with that. Elaine Barton said that the current rules state that the individual has to pass a written exam.

Mr. Hogston acknowledged that changes shouldn't be made in the middle of the process. Stacy Wall, Law Director, said that it could be changed before the next test. Bruce Hogston asked Bill Hogston (Union President) to see what the Union would think about that.

Work Session

Alissa Blankenship mentioned that the Commissioners would like to set a date for a Work Session before the September testing. Bruce Hogston stated he would like to wait until after the Deputy Chief testing. A date was set for July 23rd at 5:00 p.m. for the work session.

Discussion

Mr. Brown asked Police Chief Bruce Jamison how many positions would be filled from the current list. Chief Jamison answered that there would be two positions filled to start with. Clayton asked how many fire openings there were, and it was stated that there weren't any immediate openings.

Jim Roth stated that he would like to make a couple of comments. He said that he liked the idea of the three part testing, but he was concerned with people taking the test, just to make it competitive, knowing that the candidate was not going to accept the position.

Jim Roth's second concern was with who is on the Interview Board. Particularly, he is concerned that the City Manager and other city employees are on the Board. He stated that the assessment centers that he has been on do not include the city manager, and he thinks it is better to have an unbiased board.

Adjournment

Bruce Hogston made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Alissa Blankenship seconded. Motion carried.

PIQUA CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

DATE APPROVED: _____

Clayton Brown, Chairperson

Alissa Blankenship, Secretary

Bruce Hogston, Member

Michael Gutmann, Member

David Vollette, Member



Data for Decisions in Management

July 16, 2009

Ms. Elaine Barton
Director of Human Resources
City of Piqua, Ohio
201 W. Water St.
Piqua, OH 45356

Dear Elaine:

Thank you for your inquiry regarding our promotional assessment services for your upcoming Assistant Fire Chief and Fire Captain promotional processes. We would enjoy working with you again, and our semi-custom promotional exams could be helpful for controlling fees on the written exam component of the promotional processes. Outlined below are the steps and costs for developing separate assessment and written exam processes for the ranks of Assistant Chief and Captain in the Piqua Fire Department. Our proposal does not include fees associated with conducting a job analysis of the target positions; rather, we would rely on job analysis data (e.g., existing job descriptions and/or job classification information) already collected in conjunction with input from local experts to establish links between assessment content and job-related dimensions of performance.

Assessment Process

The assessment process will yield job-related assessment exercises, evaluation guidelines, and scoring guidelines for use by assessors charged with the task of objectively evaluating candidates' performance. While at this point it has not been determined who will recruit fire service professionals from outside fire departments to serve as assessors for the assessment phase (S&A or the City), S&A will be responsible for training the assessors. The steps required to complete this project are delineated below.

- Step 1.** An S&A representative will meet with a Subject Matter Expert (SME) panel (potentially comprised of the City's Director of Human Resources, City Manager, and incumbent fire service personnel) to develop the assessment exercises. In conjunction with the SME panel, S&A will identify a number of relevant situations for measurement in the exercises for both ranks (e.g., personnel exercise, administrative exercise, tactical scenario, etc.). With the assistance of the SME panel, complete scenarios with background information will be developed. A typical scenario involves background information on a given situation and structured questions regarding what action the candidate would take. S&A will ensure that assessment exercises assess performance dimensions that are job-related and important to the ranks of Assistant Chief and Captain in the Piqua Fire Department.
- Step 2.** **(Optional).** An S&A consultant will conduct an assessment phase orientation session for candidates. In this session, the consultant will describe the assessment exercises and dimensions on which candidates will be rated. From our experience, the more candidates know about the promotional process, the better they feel about it. Therefore, we recommend a thorough orientation for the assessment phase which will be conducted at a date and time chosen by the department.
- Step 3.** Once the assessment exercises have been developed, S&A would work with the SME panel to generate a list of ideal behaviors/responses indicative of the Knowledge, Skills,



Standard
& Associates, Inc.

Data for Decisions in Management

and Abilities (KSAs) elicited by each exercise. These behaviors will be compiled for each dimension in each exercise. They will be used to create behavioral checklists for each exercise which will help assessors when they rate the candidates. S&A will develop a first draft and will work with the SMEs to refine the list.

- Step 4.** S&A will work with the assessors chosen by the Department for this/these promotional process(es) (or those that S&A recruits). Depending on process timing, it may be feasible to use the same panel for both processes. The number of assessors required depends on the final number of candidates and exercises. Based on our understanding of the process, we anticipate 3 to 5 candidates for the Assistant Fire Chief process and 6 to 8 candidates for the Fire Captain process. Three (3) exercises are anticipated for each assessment process. The assessors are typically fire service professionals from other departments. Once the assessor list has been finalized, S&A will conduct a thorough training session. The training will include (but not be limited to) the following components: 1) Assessment philosophy and nature; 2) Orientation and background on the Piqua Fire Department; 3) Discussion and training on the assessment dimensions; 4) Discussion and training on all assessment exercises; 5) Training on rating criteria for each exercise; 6) General training on rater observation; and 7) How to conduct summary and consensus meetings.
- Step 5.** An S&A staff member will be present for administration of the assessment phase process. The number of days needed is a function of the number of candidates eligible for this phase, as well as the number of exercises. We anticipate 1 day for administration for each process (Assistant Fire Chief and Fire Captain). Although it would ultimately be the Department's responsibility, S&A would work with the Department to secure the appropriate space, equipment, materials, etc., for the assessment exercises.
- Step 6.** Assessors will rate each candidate immediately following each exercise. After they have rated the candidate, the assessors will have a brief consensus discussion to determine the extent of rating agreement and clarify any aspect of a candidate's performance where there is disagreement.
- Step 7.** Assessment exercise ratings will be collected, entered, checked and scored by S&A. The results will be presented in the format desired by the civil service commission.

Assessment Process Fees (Two Ranks)

This fee proposal is broken down by project step as outlined in our methodology. This price quote is based on the assumption that there will be approximately 3 to 5 Assistant Fire Chief Candidates sitting for the assessment phase for this process, and 6 to 8 candidates sitting for the Fire Captain process.

Project Step	Description	Total
1.	Meet with SME panel to review jobs of Assistant Fire Chief and Fire Captain, identify dimensions (areas) of measurement, develop exercises (3 assessment exercises per rank) and preliminary evaluation guidelines. Fee assumes one meeting. Should processes be conducted separately, with separate development meetings, fees would be \$3,500 per rank.	\$6,500.00
2.	Preparation and delivery of a Candidate Orientation Session (one session). Optional.	\$750.00



Stanard
& Associates, Inc.

Data for Decisions in Management

3.	Meet with SME panel to confirm exercise content and further refine evaluation guidelines/scoring criteria and rating scales. Fee assumes one meeting. Should processes be conducted separately, with separate development meetings, fees would be \$1,000 per rank.	\$1,750.00
4.	Train assessors, prepare all candidate assessment materials	\$2,000.00
5 and 6.	Administer assessment process (we estimate a total of 1 day for administration. We will have one S&A consultant on site to coordinate the administration of the exercises).	\$3,000.00
7.	Scoring and reporting of assessment process results	\$900.00
Total	Total (not including Optional services) for Two Ranks	\$14,150.00*

- Assessor fees are not included. Should S&A recruit assessors, our coordination fee is \$500. S&A also compensates assessors at a rate of \$300 per day per assessor plus mileage, meals and other travel expenses for participation in the assessment process and assessor training. This is a pass through expense billed back to the City, and paid by S&A directly to each assessor for their work on the project.

Semi-Custom Promotional Written Exams

While we do not have "off-the-shelf tests" for the ranks of Assistant Fire Chief or Fire Captain, we have an extensive item bank that could be utilized for developing these tests more cost-effectively. Below are the steps and costs of developing a 100 question off-the shelf exam for each rank, for the Piqua Fire Department.

- Step 1.** S&A forwards a list of sources and number of items available by text to the City of Piqua for review (see attached).
- Step 2.** Subject Matter Experts (SMEs) in the City who are knowledgeable regarding the position review the list of sources and the sources themselves to identify the number of items to be drawn from each (up to 100 questions). The City forwards this information to S&A.
- Step 3.** S&A prepares a reading list/study guide based on the specifications provided by the City of Piqua.
- Step 4.** S&A prepares and formats the test booklets for the City based on their specifications.
- Step 5.** S&A provides the City with testing materials, including the final test documents, answer sheets, and administration guidelines.
- Step 6.** After the test administration, the City forwards test booklets and answer sheets to S&A via a traceable carrier. S&A scores the exam and provides the results to the authorized contact person for the City or Civil Service Commission.



Stanard
& Associates, Inc.

Data for Decisions in Management

Project Component	Fee
Test construction fee.	\$450 per exam
Cost per candidate.	\$100 per exam booklet (includes scoring and reporting)
Shipping and handling	TBD
Responding to candidate challenges (optional)	\$175/hour
Writing additional items (from department-specific sources, for example; optional)	\$45/item

If needed, additional consulting (i.e., responding to candidate challenges/grievances, litigation support, expert witness testimony, depositions, statistical analyses, attending special meetings, etc.) will be billed at our current hourly rates which are \$175.00 per hour for Bachelors and Masters-level staff and \$250.00 per hour for Ph.D.-level staff. All shipping and handling, printing, and travel-related expenses will be kept to a minimum and billed as incurred.

I have also attached a document that outlines by title and subject the sources that test questions could be drawn from. Prior to selecting reading materials, it is critical that you review these sources to determine which materials are most relevant to the selection of an Assistant Fire Chief and Fire Captain in Piqua, Ohio.

Additional Assumptions Across Promotional Process Components

- The Piqua Fire Department, or the City will be responsible for securing a location for the assessment and oral interview process administrations.
- The Piqua Fire Department will provide a contact person for the project who is responsible for coordinating activities, such as providing S&A with requested information and scheduling meetings with internal SMEs and external assessors (should the City decide to recruit assessors on its own).
- While S&A strives to become familiar with each client's local circumstances, we rely on contact personnel and/or the client agency's legal counsel to ensure processes and procedures adhere to local rules (e.g., civil service commission rules, etc.).
- S&A invoices for one-half payment up front and the other half upon project completion.

Thank you for your consideration. We look forward to the prospect of working with you on these important projects. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me.

Best regards,

Brian C. Kitzman, Ph.D.
Vice President

**List of Available Promotional Test Sources – Rank of Company Officer and Higher
Updated 4/09**

Source	Appx. # of items
IFSTA Texts	
IFSTA Essentials of Fire Fighting (5th ed)	190
IFSTA Fire Department Company Officer (3rd ed)	115
IFSTA Building Construction Related to the Fire Service (2nd ed)	125
IFSTA Fire ground Support Operations (1st ed)	38
IFSTA Fire Dept Aerial Apparatus/Operator Handbook (1st ed)	48
IFSTA Pumping Apparatus Driver/Op Handbook (1st ed)	100
IFSTA Chief Officer	25
Command, Strategy and Tactics	
Fire Command by Brunacini (2nd ed)	50
The Fire Chief's Handbook by Eversole (6th ed)	100
Fire Officer's Handbook of Tactics by Norman (3rd ed)	142
Model Procedures Guide for Structural Firefighting (2nd ed)	20
Strategic and Tactical Considerations on the Fireground by Smith (2nd ed)	55
Truck Company Fireground Operations by Richman (2nd ed)	25
Management and Supervision	
Fire Service Administration by Grant & Hoover (1st ed)	100
ICMA Advanced Supervisory Practices (1st ed)	30
Management in the Fire Service by Carter and Rausch(3rd ed)	100
NFPA Fire Officer Principles & Practices	90
ICMA Effective Supervisory Practices (2 nd)	35
Safety	
FD Incident Safety Officer by Dodson (1st ed)	50
Safety & Survival on the Fireground by Dunn (1st ed)	40
Firefighter Rescue & Survival by Kolomay & Hoff	25
NIMS – National Incident Management System	50

Other Topics	
Building Construction for the Fire Service - Brannigan (4th ed)	50
Vehicle Rescue & Extrication by Moore (2nd ed)	45
Emergency Care of the Sick & Injured by Pollack (9th)	25
2004 Emergency Response Guidebook	25